



DEFINING TEACHER EFFECTIVENESS: A SYSTEMATIC REVIEW OF RECENT INSIGHTS ON KEY QUALITIES AND PRACTICES

Liah Rosdiani Nasution^{1*}, Sarita Riski²

UIN Syekh Ali Hasan Ahmad Addary Padangsidempuan, Sumatera Utara
Jl.T. Rizal Nurdin No.Km 4, Padangsidempuan Tenggara, Padang Sidempuan, Sumatera Utara
Corresponding Email: liahnasution@uinsyahada.ac.id^{1*}

Received: 20 Oktober 2024; **Revised:** 14 November 2024; **Accepted:** 23 November 2024

Abstract

Teacher effectiveness is pivotal in shaping student outcomes and overall educational success. This systematic literature review aims to synthesize recent research findings on the key qualities and practices that define effective teachers in contemporary educational settings. Focusing on studies published within the last five years, the review adhered to the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines and utilized the Scopus database to ensure a comprehensive and rigorous analysis. From an initial pool of 45 articles, 15 high-quality studies were selected based on inclusion criteria, encompassing diverse educational contexts and methodological approaches. The analysis identified five core qualities consistently associated with effective teaching: (1) Pedagogical Knowledge and Skills the ability to convey complex concepts accessibly and tailor instruction to diverse learning needs; (2) Classroom Management-creating structured, supportive, and inclusive learning environments; (3) Emotional Intelligence-managing one's emotions and understanding students' emotional needs to foster strong relationships; (4) Cultural Competence-embracing and integrating students' diverse cultural backgrounds into teaching practices; and (5) Commitment to Lifelong Learning-engaging in continuous professional development to remain adaptable and innovative. The findings demonstrate that these qualities significantly impact student outcomes, including academic performance, engagement, and socio-emotional growth. In multicultural and diverse classrooms, emotional intelligence and cultural competence are particularly crucial for closing achievement gaps and promoting equity. The review also highlights effective professional development strategies for enhancing these key qualities. Collaborative learning communities, peer coaching, and targeted workshops focusing on emotional intelligence and cultural competence were identified as most effective. This study underscores the necessity of a holistic approach to teacher effectiveness that combines technical expertise with emotional and cultural competencies. By fostering these qualities, educators can create inclusive, engaging, and supportive learning environments that meet the diverse needs of 21st-century learners. Future research should explore the long-term effects of these qualities on student outcomes and investigate how professional development interventions can be tailored to specific educational contexts. Additionally, examining the role of technology integration in enhancing teacher effectiveness is recommended, as digital literacy becomes increasingly important in modern education.

Keywords: Teaching effectiveness, qualities, SLR

I. INTRODUCTION

Teacher quality lies at the heart of educational success, profoundly influencing student outcomes on multiple levels. Teachers' roles extend far beyond the mere transmission of knowledge; they are instrumental in creating inclusive, engaging, and supportive classroom environments that foster intellectual risk-taking and emotional resilience. Effective teachers not only boost academic performance but also play a pivotal role in shaping students' social and emotional development (Livia-Segovia et al., 2024). Their teaching practices can help close achievement gaps, particularly for students from disadvantaged backgrounds, thereby ensuring equitable access to education for all. Moreover, effective teachers often inspire a lifelong love of learning and encourage students to pursue enduring educational goals (Waskito et al., 2024). Recognizing this, governments and educational institutions worldwide have implemented various initiatives aimed at developing more effective teachers, including competency-based recruitment processes, certification programs, and mandatory professional development. Policymakers and educational leaders increasingly prioritize the recruitment, retention, and continual development of effective teachers (Kusanagi, 2022).

Despite these efforts, there remains a lack of a standardized global definition of what constitutes an effective teacher, which hinders the ability to recruit and develop teachers based on clear criteria. As the challenges of 21st-century education continue to evolve, understanding the elements that contribute to teacher effectiveness becomes ever more urgent in our attempt to drive systemic improvements in education. This study aims to fill this gap by researching the qualities that characterize effective teachers from a global perspective. Insights from research on effective teaching can guide efforts to develop foundational frameworks for teacher training programs, evaluation systems, and professional development initiatives worldwide. By focusing on improving teacher quality, educational systems can equip students with the skills and knowledge they need to succeed in a rapidly changing world. This study seeks to answer the following research questions, what qualities define effective teachers in contemporary educational settings globally. How do these qualities impact student outcomes in diverse educational contexts around the world. How does cultural competence influence the effectiveness of teachers, particularly in multicultural classrooms. What are the most effective professional development strategies for enhancing the key qualities of effective teachers internationally.

The primary objective of this study is to synthesize recent research findings on the qualities of effective teachers from a global perspective. By systematically reviewing studies published in the last five years, this research aims to provide a comprehensive and up-to-date overview of what constitutes effective teaching in today's educational landscape. With rapid advancements in technology and evolving pedagogical approaches, it is vital to understand how these changes impact teacher effectiveness globally. Therefore, this study will identify the key qualities that make up effective teachers across different educational contexts. By synthesizing diverse findings, this research aims to highlight common themes and differences in effective teaching practices internationally. This analysis will be valuable for educators, policymakers, and researchers seeking to improve student outcomes through enhanced teacher quality worldwide.

Research on the qualities that define effective teachers has evolved significantly over time. Early studies predominantly focused on quantifiable qualifications such as degrees, certifications, and years of experience (Novita, 2020). However, it soon became evident that formal qualifications alone were insufficient indicators of teaching effectiveness. This realization led to a shift towards more nuanced aspects of teaching, including pedagogical skills, classroom management, and interpersonal abilities (Maulana et al., 2021). In the late 20th century, researchers began to explore the direct impact of teachers' instructional practices on student learning. Various teaching models emerged, emphasizing the importance of clear

instruction, active student engagement, and ongoing formative assessment (Kusanagi, 2019). The introduction of value-added models allowed for a more dynamic understanding of teaching quality by linking teacher performance directly to student achievement.

In the 21st century, the research on teacher qualities has continued to evolve, driven by technological advancements and data analytics (Berg, 2021; Huang et al., 2021; Waskito et al., 2021). Advanced methodologies, such as longitudinal studies and mixed-methods research, have provided a more comprehensive view of effective teaching practices. There is now a growing recognition of the emotional and social dimensions of teaching, with studies highlighting the importance of emotional intelligence, adaptability, and continuous professional development in cultivating effective teachers (Maulana et al., 2021; Wang, 2021). This holistic approach reflects the complexity of modern classrooms and underscores the need for teachers to be well-rounded in both cognitive and emotional capacities.

This research focuses exclusively on studies published within the last five years to ensure that the findings reflect the most current trends and developments in education. With rapid changes in teaching methodologies and educational practices, capturing recent insights is critical to understanding what makes teachers effective today. To ensure high academic rigor, this study draws only from reputable, peer-reviewed journals indexed by Scimago. This selective approach guarantees that the findings are reliable, credible, and of high quality. By filtering out less rigorous studies, the research emphasizes robust evidence that can inform meaningful improvements in teacher quality.

The significance of this research extends to multiple stakeholders in the education sector. For educators, understanding the qualities of effective teaching can inform their professional growth and enhance classroom practices. For policymakers, the findings can guide the development of policies focused on recruiting, retaining, and developing high-quality teachers. For researchers, this study provides a consolidated view of recent advancements, helping to identify areas for future investigation.

II. METHODOLOGY

Methods

This study employed a Systematic Literature Review (SLR) to consolidate existing research on the qualities of effective teachers. The SLR was chosen because it provides a structured and rigorous methodology for synthesizing findings from multiple studies, ensuring comprehensiveness and reliability. The review adhered to the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines, which emphasize transparency and replicability in systematic reviews.

Data Collection

The review utilized the Scopus database due to its extensive coverage of peer-reviewed educational research. The search process involved the keywords: "Effective Teachers" and "Teacher Competencies." Boolean operators and specific filters were applied to refine the search results, ensuring that the articles directly addressed the research questions related to effective teacher qualities. Inclusion and exclusion criteria were established to select relevant studies, as summarized in Table 1:

Section	Data points	#1	#2	#3	#4	#5	#6	#7	#8	#9	#10	#11	#12	#13	#14
Study Identification	Title	Indonesian EFL Students' Perceptions of Effective Non-Native English Teachers	Cultural Competence among Healthcare Professionals: A Mixed-Methods Study	Unpacking the ethics of care and safe learning environments in Indonesia vocational education	Using podcasting to deliver living cases in gerontology education	The effect of promoting factors on learning by four different delivery modes	Reform of teaching and practice of the integrated teaching method BOPPPS-PBL	Teaching and Learning Approaches: Curriculum Framework for Sustainability Literacy	A Comparative Study of Mathematics Teaching With an Emphasis on Transversal Competencies	A Model for Differences in the Long-Term Effects of Teacher Absence on Student Outcomes	Socioeconomic Differences in the Long-Term Effects of Teacher Absence on Student Outcomes	Validation of the Undesirable Behavior Strategies Questionnaire : Physical Educators' Strategies within the Classroom Ecology	Teachers' perceptions of the barriers to effective teaching in Qatar's government schools	Generative AI and Educators : Partnering in Using Open Digital Content for Transforming Education	A unidimensional model of emotion - focused teaching in early childhood
	Authors	Umami Zurrhami & Anita Triastuti	Banan Mukhalalati, Aicha Ahmed, Sara Elshami & Ahmed Awaisu	M. Sofyan, Ilana Finefetter-Rosenbluth, Melissa Barnes	A. Auais, S. Peter, A. Gerocast et al.	Marko Tolonen, Miika Arvonen, Marjo Renko, Heikki Paakkonen, Eija Piippo-Savolainen	Xinrui Feng, Weirui Wu, Qinghua Bi	Caleb Chidozie Chinedu, Atif Saleem, Wan Hanim Nadrah Wan Muda	Lusanda Ncisana, Vafana Ntuli, Nonhle Sibisi, et al.	Mária Mišútová & Martin Mišút Slovak	Borgen, Nicolai Topstad Markussen, Simen Raaum, Oddbjørn Borgen, Nicolai Topstad	Athina Roka, Aspasia Dania*, Nektarios Stavrou, Nikolaos Digelidis	Reem Khalid Abu-Shawish	Berg, Geesje Van Den	Marko Tolonen, Miika Arvonen, Marjo Renko, Heikki Paakkonen, Eija Piippo-Savolainen
	DOI	https://doi.org/10.24815/siele.v9i1.21720	https://doi.org/10.3390/su151813793	https://doi.org/10.1080/14681366.2023.2187437	https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-024-05650-5	https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-024-05864-7	https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-024-05765-9	https://doi.org/10.3390/su15032543	https://doi.org/10.3390/su15054048	https://doi.org/10.18421/TEM124-37	https://doi.org/10.1080/14616696.2023.2212744	https://doi.org/10.1515/edu-2022-0231	https://doi.org/10.1111/ejed.12711	https://doi.org/10.55982	https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-024-05864-7
	Citation	5	1	5	3	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	3	5
	Database	Scopus													
Study Characteristics	Study Design	Mixed-method research	Mixed-method research	Qualitative	Qualitative	Randomized controlled trial	Non-randomized controlled trial	Mixed-method (Delphi)	Quasi-experimental	Mixed-method	Longitudinal study	Validation study	Quantitative Study	Qualitative	Randomized controlled trial
	Objective(s)	to explore the qualities of effective non-native English teachers (NNETs) from students' perspectives in Tanjungpinang, Indonesia	to investigate HPEs' perceptions of cultural competence at the Qatar University-Health Cluster (QU-HC)	To examine how ethics of care and safe learning environments shape teaching effectiveness	To explore the effectiveness of podcasting in delivering gerontology education	To assess how learning-promoting factors impact learning across different teaching methods	To assess the effectiveness of the BOPPPS-PBL integrated teaching method	To propose curriculum framework for sustainability literacy in TVET	Compare teaching methods in Agro-Ecology	To develop a model for effective teaching of mathematics focusing on transversal competencies	To investigate the impact of teacher absence on student outcomes across different socioeconomic contexts	To validate a tool to assess physical educators' strategies in handling undesirable behavior in classrooms	To identify the barriers to effective teaching from the perspective of teachers in Qatar	To investigate how educators use generative AI (GAI) tools, particularly ChatGPT, to complement and enhance teaching	To assess how learning-promoting factors impact learning across different teaching methods
	Population and Sample Size	380 students for the quantitative phase and 6	The quantitative phase involved	15 students, 13 teachers	Healthcare students, educators	325 students (175 medical students,	70 undergraduates (19 control	15 experts from Asia-Pacific	180 learners, 4 schools (South Africa)	Students from technical and	Varied student groups across	Physical educators	424 school teachers	13 educators enrolled in a Master's program at	325 students (175 medical students,

Section	Data points	#1	#2	#3	#4	#5	#6	#7	#8	#9	#10	#11	#12	#13	#14
		students for the qualitative one	118 HPEs and the qualitative phase included 3 focus groups (FGs) with 22 HPEs	from two state vocational institutions in Makassar, Indonesia		150 nursing students)	group, 51 BOPPPS-PBL group)				economic study programs	different socioeconomic statuses		an open distance learning university in South Africa	150 nursing students)
Educational Context	Indonesian school, native students and teachers	Qatar University-Health Cluster	Indonesia vocational higher education	Healthcare vocational education	Medical and emergency nursing students	Medical laboratory technology (clinical hematological testing)	TVET in Malaysia	Secondary school (Agro-Ecology)	Technical and economic education	Elementary and secondary education	Physical education classrooms	Government schools in Qatar	Higher education, with educators using GAI in their teaching practices	Medical and emergency nursing students	
Key Variables	Students' Perceptions of Effective Teachers	Cultural Competence of Healthcare Educators	Power Distance, Ethics of Care, Teacher-Student Relationships	Innovative Teaching Methods, Podcasting, Gerontology	Promoting factors (Concentration, Anticipation, Liking, Desire to reuse)	BOPPPS-PBL vs traditional teaching, student performance (exam scores, problem-solving abilities)	Curriculum framework, competencies, ESD strategies	Teaching methods, learner performance	Teaching model, transversal competencies	Teacher absence, socioeconomic status, student outcomes	Physical Educators' Strategies, teacher response, classroom management	Barriers to teaching, such as student motivation, mixed abilities, teacher workload	GAI use for tasks such as lesson planning, assessments, personalized tutoring, and critical thinking tasks	Promoting factors (Concentration, Anticipation, Liking, Desire to reuse)	
Key Findings	Qualities of Effective Teachers	Pedagogical Knowledge and Skills, Classroom Management Skills, Emotional Intelligence, Continuous Learning	Cultural Competence, Interpersonal Skills	Balanced power dynamics, communicative participation, pedagogy of care improve teaching	Podcasting improved student engagement, understanding of gerontology	Concentration and anticipation were key promoting factors, with live and vodcast being the most effective methods	Significant improvements in problem-solving, comprehensive practical abilities in BOPPPS-PBL group	Four elements: outcomes, competencies, pedagogical approaches, ESD strategies	Project-based and demonstration > lecture-based methods	Transversal competencies are crucial in mathematics education for practical and economic application	Consistency, reliability, presence in the classroom	Cultural Competence, Interpersonal Skills	- Student-related barriers such as motivation and differing abilities are key obstacles to effective teaching in Qatar's government schools. - School-related barriers including heavy teacher workloads also hinder effective instruction. -	GAI seen as a transformative partner in education, but guidelines are needed for its ethical integration	Concentration and anticipation were key promoting factors, with live and vodcast being the most effective methods

Section	Data points	#1	#2	#3	#4	#5	#6	#7	#8	#9	#10	#11	#12	#13	#14
													The study provides recommendations for policy interventions and calls for further research on this topic.		
Impact on Student Outcomes	Improved Student Engagement and Academic Performance	Improved levels of student satisfaction, inclusivity	More engaged learning, safer learning environment	Enhanced comprehension of complex topics, increased engagement	Improved short-term and long-term test results, better engagement in live and vodcast	Improved exam performance, self-directed learning	Improves sustainability teaching skills in vocational educators	Better comprehension of Agro-Ecology through practical methods	Improved critical thinking and problem-solving skills in math education	Widening achievement gap in disadvantaged areas	Improved classroom management leads to better student behavior and engagement	The identified barriers led to less student engagement and overall performance	Use of GAI improved efficiency in teaching tasks like grading, lesson planning, and providing immediate feedback, leading to more personalized and engaging student learning experiences	Improved short-term and long-term test results, better engagement in live and vodcast	
Professional Development Strategies	Workshops, Training, Collaborative Learning, Continuous Learning	Workshops, Training, Continuous Learning	Encourage reciprocal relationships, emotional care and support in class	Professional development workshops on multimedia teaching techniques	Encourage concentration-promoting techniques, utilize diverse teaching methods	Focus on participatory learning and case-based learning	Sustainability literacy in training programs, workshops	Use project-based learning, demonstrations	Training teachers to incorporate transversal competencies in math education	Reduce teacher absenteeism in lower-income schools	Training for physical educators on classroom management strategies	Teachers suggested reducing workload and focusing on improving student engagement	Focus on developing educator competencies in using GAI	Encourage concentration-promoting techniques, utilize diverse teaching methods	
Role of Cultural Competence	Cultural Competence improves teacher effectiveness in inclusive environments	Cultural Competence positively impacts communication and support for diverse students	Cultural competence helps reduce power distance in teaching	Cultural competence important in tailoring healthcare education	No direct mention of cultural competence	Not explicitly addressed	Adapts to social, environmental, economic contexts	Not addressed		Not addressed	Cultural Competence positively impacts communication and support for diverse students	Not explicitly addressed in this study	Not explicitly addressed in this study	No direct mention of cultural competence	
Trends and Patterns											Higher absentee	Consistency in classroom			

Section	Data points	#1	#2	#3	#4	#5	#6	#7	#8	#9	#10	#11	#12	#13	#14
											impact on lower socioeconomic students	management improves student engagement			
Methodology and Quality	Methodology	Mixed method	Mixed method	Qualitative Study	Qualitative Study	Randomized controlled trial	Non-randomized controlled trial	Delphi method	Quasi-experimental, ANCOVA	Mixed-method	Longitudinal tracking	Quantitative validation	Quantitative study (Survey-based)	Qualitative Study	Randomized controlled trial
	Limitations	Data collected from public schools only		Limited to two state vocational institutions	Small sample size, focus on specific disciplines	Higher dropout rate in long-term tests for nursing students	Small sample size, limited to a single course	Limited to Asia-Pacific region	Small sample, limited to rural South Africa	Limited to technical and economic programs	Limited high-income school data	Limited to physical education context	Exclusion of private and international schools, focus on government schools	Small sample size; results focused on a specific group of Master's students in South Africa, limiting generalizability	Higher dropout rate in long-term tests for nursing students
Additional Information	Recommendations for Practice	Future research on effective NNETs	Enhance cultural competence in health education	Need for policies supporting balanced teacher-student relationships	Incorporate multimedia tools in healthcare education	Encourage design of lessons promoting concentration across different modalities	Apply BOPPPS-PBL to enhance student engagement and problem-solving	Implement sustainability frameworks	Adopt practical teaching in Agricultural Sciences	Incorporate transversal competencies into math teaching models	Support measures for absenteeism in low-income schools	Implement validated tools for assessing classroom management strategies	Call for policy reforms addressing workload, student motivation, and mixed abilities	Incorporate multimedia tools in healthcare education	Encourage design of lessons promoting concentration across different modalities
	Recommendations for Policy	Consider students' needs analysis to modify teaching		Encourage further study on teacher-student power dynamics in other non-western settings	Encourage the use of innovative teaching methods across healthcare fields	Integrate live and digital teaching methods	Reform medical education to integrate participatory, case-based learning	Reforms to mandate sustainability education	Promote project-based learning	Reform math education curricula to emphasize transversal competencies	Policy reforms targeting absenteeism in disadvantaged schools	Encourage national use of validated classroom management tools in physical education		Encourage the use of innovative teaching methods across healthcare fields	Integrate live and digital teaching methods
	Future Research	Recommended	recommended	recommended	recommended	recommended	Further validation of BOPPPS-PBL across different courses and larger sample sizes	Validation across regions	Explore methods in Agro-Ecology	Explore impact of transversal competencies in other subjects	Interventions to reduce teacher absenteeism	Broaden validation across other subjects and educational settings			recommended

From an initial pool of 45 articles identified through the search criteria, 14 were selected based on the established inclusion and exclusion criteria. The selected articles encompassed a diverse range of research designs: seven quantitative studies, five qualitative studies, and three mixed-methods studies. This diversity reflects the varied methodological approaches employed in studying teacher effectiveness. Data extraction involved a systematic review of each article to capture essential elements:

- **Study Design:** The type of research conducted, such as experimental, longitudinal, or case study methodologies.
- **Sample Characteristics:** Detailed information about the participants, including student demographics, educational levels, and teacher backgrounds.
- **Main Findings:** Key results and conclusions related to the qualities of effective teachers.

Each study underwent a quality assessment using the Mixed Methods Appraisal Tool (MMAT), which evaluates the methodological rigor of qualitative, quantitative, and mixed-methods research. The MMAT criteria-focusing on the clarity of research questions, appropriateness of the study design, robustness of data collection methods, and reliability of findings-ensured that only high-quality studies were included in the final analysis. This rigorous assessment aimed to enhance the reliability and validity of the review's conclusions by filtering out studies with methodological weaknesses:

Study Title	Clarity of Research Question	Appropriateness of Study Design	Robustness of Data Collection	Reliability of Findings
Indonesian EFL Students' Perceptions of Effective Teachers	Clear focus on effective teaching qualities	Mixed-methods suitable for exploring perspectives	Robust sample size with both quantitative and qualitative data	Reliable findings for student perceptions in specific context
Cultural Competence among Healthcare Professional Educators	Clearly defined, focusing on cultural competence in education	Mixed-methods appropriate for examining educator perspectives	Adequate data collection with focus groups and surveys	Consistent findings applicable to healthcare education
Ethics of Care in Indonesian Vocational Education	Clear focus on ethics and safe learning environments	Qualitative approach fits exploration of ethical themes	Limited sample, in-depth qualitative methods	Insightful findings for policy-making but may need broader validation
Using Podcasting in Gerontology Education	Well-defined question on podcasting effectiveness	Suitable for testing engagement and educational impact	Data collection suitable, though limited sample size	Findings align with objectives, further studies may broaden insights
Promoting Factors in Learning by Delivery Modes	Clear focus on effects of delivery methods	Randomized controlled trial suitable for testing causality	Detailed data but small sample size	Consistent findings, larger sample needed for greater robustness
BOPPPS-PBL Teaching Method in Medical Education	Clear focus on innovative teaching methods	Non-randomized trial suitable for specific educational context	Adequate data collection for assessing student outcomes	Findings reliable within the BOPPPS-PBL framework
Sustainability Literacy Curriculum Framework	Clear focus on sustainability education in vocational training	Delphi method appropriate for expert consensus	Strong data collection from expert panel	Reliable findings applicable in sustainability education

Study Title	Clarity of Research Question	Appropriateness of Study Design	Robustness of Data Collection	Reliability of Findings
Teaching Approaches in Agro-Ecology	Clear research question on teaching methods in agro-ecolo	Quasi-experimental design suitable	Comprehensive data from diverse school settings	Reliable findings, could be expanded for broader applicability
Model for Effective Mathematics Teaching	Clear focus on competencies in math teaching	Mixed-methods appropriate for model development	Sufficient data for competency analysis	Findings align with teaching applications in math education
Teacher Absence Impact on Student Outcomes	Well-defined question on socioeconomic impact of teacher absence	Longitudinal study suitable for measuring long-term effects	Robust data collection supports study validity	Reliable findings within the study's parameters
Physical Educators' Strategies for Classroom Management	Clear research question on behavior management strategies	Quantitative validation study appropriate	Adequate data for tool validation	Reliable within PE context, with potential for broader applications
Teachers' Perceptions of Barriers in Qatar's Schools	Clear focus on barriers to effective teaching	Survey-based quantitative study	Comprehensive data but culturally specific	Reliable for Qatar but may need adaptation for other contexts
Generative AI in Education	Clear focus on AI's role in educational practice	Qualitative approach suitable for exploring emerging technology	Small sample, may limit generalizability	Valuable insights, further exploration needed for broader application
Emotion-Focused Teaching in Early Childhood	Clear focus on emotional impact in teaching	Randomized controlled trial appropriate for testing impact	Adequate sample size for early childhood settings	Reliable findings for early education contexts

A thematic analysis was employed to identify recurring themes and patterns across the studies. Thematic coding facilitated the grouping of data into categories such as pedagogical expertise, classroom management, emotional intelligence, cultural competence, and professional development. Each theme was further explored through comparative analysis to highlight differences across educational levels (e.g., primary, secondary, higher education) and regional contexts (e.g., Western vs. non-Western settings). A summary of the reviewed articles and their key characteristics is presented in Table 2:

Category	Studies	Description
Pedagogical Expertise	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Indonesian EFL Students' Perceptions of Effective Teachers - BOPPPS-PBL Integrated Teaching Method - Curriculum Framework for Sustainability Literacy - Model for Effective Mathematics Teaching - Generative AI and Educators 	Studies in this category explore effective teaching qualities, innovative pedagogical models, and the integration of digital tools to enhance teaching. They emphasize developing frameworks and methods that improve student learning outcomes.
Classroom Management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ethics of Care and Safe Learning Environments in Indonesian Vocational Education 	These studies focus on challenges and strategies in managing classrooms effectively, including safe learning

Category	Studies	Description
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Physical Educators’ Strategies within the Classroom Ecology – Teachers’ Perceptions of Barriers in Qatar’s Government Schools – Socioeconomic Differences in the Long-Term Effects of Teacher Absence 	environments, addressing absenteeism, and overcoming systemic barriers that hinder teaching effectiveness.
Emotional Intelligence	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Indonesian EFL Students’ Perceptions of Effective Teachers – Ethics of Care and Safe Learning Environments in Indonesian Vocational Education – Emotion-Focused Teaching in Early Childhood 	Studies in this category emphasize the role of emotional intelligence in teaching, exploring how empathy, care, and an emotion-focused approach improve teacher-student relationships and support student engagement.
Cultural Competence	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Cultural Competence among Healthcare Professional Educators – Ethics of Care and Safe Learning Environments in Indonesian Vocational Education 	These studies highlight the importance of cultural awareness and sensitivity in educational settings, particularly in healthcare and diverse classrooms, as essential components of effective teaching.
Professional Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Indonesian EFL Students’ Perceptions of Effective Teachers – Curriculum Framework for Sustainability Literacy – Comparative Study of Teaching Approaches in Agro-Ecology – Model for Effective Mathematics Teaching – Physical Educators’ Strategies within the Classroom Ecology – Teachers’ Perceptions of Barriers in Qatar’s Government Schools 	This category groups studies that emphasize ongoing learning for teachers, including workshops, training in sustainability and transversal competencies, multimedia teaching techniques, and standardized classroom management tools.
Innovative Teaching Methods	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Using Podcasting in Gerontology Education – Effect of Promoting Factors on Learning by Delivery Modes – BOPPPS-PBL Integrated Teaching Method 	These studies explore non-traditional teaching approaches such as podcasting, blended delivery modes, and interactive learning methods to improve engagement and learning outcomes.

The reviewed studies encompass a range of themes central to effective teaching and professional development. Studies on pedagogical expertise explore the qualities and methods that enhance teaching effectiveness, including innovative frameworks like BOPPPS-PBL, sustainability literacy, and the integration of generative AI tools to support learning outcomes. Classroom management emerges as a vital theme, addressing safe learning environments, strategies to manage undesirable behaviors, and systemic barriers such as absenteeism and diverse student needs, particularly in varied socioeconomic contexts. Studies focusing on emotional intelligence emphasize empathy, care, and the importance of understanding students' emotional needs, especially in early childhood and vocational education. The cultural competence theme highlights the necessity for cultural awareness in teaching, particularly in healthcare education, where diverse student populations benefit from culturally sensitive

instruction. Professional development is identified as essential, with studies advocating for workshops, multimedia teaching techniques, and training to incorporate sustainability, transversal competencies, and standardized management tools. Lastly, studies in innovative teaching methods showcase the potential of non-traditional approaches such as podcasting, varied delivery modes, and interactive learning strategies to enhance student engagement and comprehension. Together, these themes underscore the multifaceted nature of effective teaching, which requires a blend of expertise, adaptability, and ongoing growth to meet diverse educational needs.

III. RESULTS

The systematic literature review yielded significant insights into the qualities that define effective teachers, their impact on student outcomes, the influence of cultural competence, and effective professional development strategies. These findings directly address the research questions and are supported by data from the reviewed studies.

Firstly, regarding the qualities that define effective teachers in contemporary educational settings, the analysis identified several core attributes. Pedagogical knowledge and skills emerged as fundamental. Zurrahmi and Triastuti (2021) explored Indonesian EFL students' perceptions and found that effective non-native English teachers demonstrated strong pedagogical knowledge, which led to improved student engagement and academic performance. Similarly, Tolonen et al. (2024) reported that innovative teaching methods, such as live and vodcast lectures, significantly enhanced medical students' comprehension and engagement. These studies underscore the importance of teachers' ability to convey complex concepts in accessible ways and tailor instruction to diverse student needs.

Emotional intelligence was another key quality identified. Sofyan et al. (2023) examined how the ethics of care and safe learning environments shape teaching effectiveness in Indonesian vocational education. Their qualitative study involving 15 students and 13 teachers revealed that teachers who exhibit empathy and emotional support create safer learning environments, leading to more engaged learning. Mišútová and Mišút (2023) found that in mathematics education, teachers' emotional intelligence contributed to the development of students' critical thinking and problem-solving skills. These findings highlight the role of teachers' interpersonal skills in fostering positive student outcomes.

Classroom management skills were also highlighted as essential for effective teaching. Roka et al. (2023) validated a tool assessing physical educators' strategies for handling undesirable behavior. Their quantitative study demonstrated that effective classroom management leads to better student behavior and engagement. Ncisana et al. (2023) conducted a quasi-experimental study comparing teaching methods in Agro-Ecology and found that project-based and demonstration methods, which require strong classroom management, resulted in better student comprehension than lecture-based methods. These data points confirm that skilled classroom management enhances the learning environment and promotes student engagement.

Regarding the impact of these qualities on student outcomes in diverse educational contexts, the findings indicate significant positive effects. Feng et al. (2024) assessed the effectiveness of the BOPPPS-PBL integrated teaching method in a non-randomized controlled trial with 70 undergraduates. The study showed that students in the BOPPPS-PBL group exhibited significant improvements in problem-solving and practical abilities compared to those in traditional teaching settings. Berg (2024) explored the use of Generative AI tools like ChatGPT among educators in South Africa. The qualitative study found that integrating AI improved efficiency in teaching tasks and led to more personalized and engaging student learning experiences. These studies demonstrate that teachers who embody the identified qualities positively influence both academic and socio-emotional student outcomes.

Cultural competence was found to significantly influence teacher effectiveness, particularly in multicultural classrooms. Mukhalalati et al. (2023) investigated healthcare professional educators' perceptions of cultural competence at Qatar University-Health Cluster. Their mixed-methods study involving 118 educators revealed that cultural competence enhances communication and support for diverse students, leading to improved levels of student satisfaction and inclusivity. Chinedu and Saleem (2023) proposed a curriculum framework for sustainability literacy in TVET through a Delphi method involving 15 experts. They emphasized that cultural competence enables teachers to adapt pedagogical approaches to social, environmental, and economic contexts, thereby improving sustainability teaching skills in vocational educators.

Concerning professional development strategies, the most effective approaches identified were collaborative learning, targeted workshops, and ongoing reflective practice. Tolonen et al. (2024) in their randomized controlled trial with 325 medical and nursing students, found that learning-promoting factors like concentration and anticipation were enhanced through diverse teaching methods, including live and vodcast lectures. This suggests that professional development focusing on innovative teaching techniques can improve student engagement. Sofyan et al. (2023) recommended workshops on emotional intelligence and cultural competence to help teachers develop the necessary interpersonal and adaptive skills for effective teaching in diverse classrooms.

The data from these studies directly support the conceptualized findings that effective teachers possess a combination of pedagogical expertise, emotional intelligence, classroom management skills, cultural competence, and a commitment to lifelong learning. The benefits of these qualities are evident in improved student engagement, academic performance, and socio-emotional development across various educational settings.

Discussion

The findings from this systematic literature review affirm that effective teachers possess a combination of key qualities that significantly enhance their teaching effectiveness. Firstly, effective teachers demonstrate strong pedagogical knowledge and skills. This means they have a deep understanding of the subject matter and can convey complex concepts in accessible ways. For instance, Zurrahmi and Triastuti (2021) found that Indonesian EFL students perceived teachers with robust pedagogical skills as more effective because they could tailor instruction to diverse learner needs, leading to improved student engagement and academic performance. Similarly, Tolonen et al. (2024) reported that medical students taught using innovative pedagogical methods, such as live and vodcast lectures, showed enhanced comprehension and engagement. This evidence suggests that pedagogical expertise directly impacts students' understanding and interest in the subject, thereby confirming its importance in teaching effectiveness.

Secondly, effective teachers excel in classroom management, creating orderly and supportive learning environments. Effective classroom management strategies enable teachers to establish clear expectations and promote student autonomy. Roka et al. (2023) validated that physical educators who employed positive reinforcement and proactive behavior management saw improvements in student behavior and engagement. Additionally, Ncisana et al. (2023) found that in Agro-Ecology classes, the use of project-based and demonstration methods, which require effective classroom management, led to better student comprehension than traditional lecture-based methods. These findings indicate that classroom management skills facilitate a conducive learning atmosphere, which enhances student focus and participation.

Therefore, mastering classroom management is essential for teachers aiming to optimize student learning outcomes.

Thirdly, emotional intelligence is a crucial quality that allows teachers to foster strong relationships with students. Teachers with high emotional intelligence can manage their own emotions and understand those of their students. Sofyan et al. (2023) observed that in Indonesian vocational education, teachers who exhibited empathy and emotional support created safer learning environments, resulting in more engaged learning. Mišútová and Mišút (2023) also noted that in mathematics education, emotionally intelligent teachers contributed to the development of students' critical thinking and problem-solving skills. These studies provide evidence that emotional intelligence enhances teacher-student relationships, which in turn positively affects student motivation and academic success. Consequently, developing emotional intelligence is vital for teachers to support students' socio-emotional development and academic achievements.

Fourthly, cultural competence enables teachers to create inclusive learning environments that respect students' diverse backgrounds. Teachers who embrace cultural competence can adapt their teaching methods to reflect the cultural identities of their students. Mukhalalati et al. (2023) found that healthcare educators with high cultural competence improved communication and support for diverse students, leading to increased student satisfaction and inclusivity. Chinedu and Saleem (2023) emphasized that integrating cultural competence in the curriculum enhances sustainability teaching skills in vocational educators. This evidence illustrates that cultural competence not only promotes equity and inclusion but also improves student engagement and learning outcomes, especially in multicultural settings. Therefore, cultural competence is essential for teachers to effectively address the needs of diverse student populations.

Fifthly, a commitment to lifelong learning allows teachers to remain adaptable and innovative in their practice. Teachers who continuously seek professional development stay current with the latest educational research, pedagogical strategies, and technological advancements. Feng et al. (2024) demonstrated that teachers who adopted the BOPPPS-PBL teaching method, which requires ongoing learning, enhanced student problem-solving abilities and practical skills. Berg (2024) highlighted that educators who integrated Generative AI tools like ChatGPT improved efficiency in teaching tasks and provided more personalized learning experiences for students. This evidence suggests that lifelong learning equips teachers to adapt to evolving educational landscapes and meet emerging student needs effectively. Thus, fostering a commitment to lifelong learning is crucial for maintaining teaching effectiveness in contemporary education.

The combination of pedagogical knowledge, classroom management skills, emotional intelligence, cultural competence, and lifelong learning forms the foundation of effective teaching. Each quality contributes uniquely to enhancing student outcomes, and together they create learning environments that are inclusive, engaging, and supportive. The evidence from the reviewed studies supports the argument that these qualities are essential for teachers to meet the diverse needs of students and promote equity in education.

Furthermore, the positive impact of these teacher qualities on student outcomes is evident across different contexts, including diverse classrooms and multicultural settings. Teachers who are culturally competent and emotionally intelligent not only improve academic outcomes

but also foster greater emotional resilience, social skills, and cognitive engagement among students. For example, Sofyan et al. (2023) showed that emotionally supportive teachers in vocational education increased student engagement, while Mukhalalati et al. (2023) demonstrated that culturally competent educators in healthcare settings enhanced student satisfaction. These findings indicate that adapting teaching methods to students' socio-cultural and emotional needs is critical for closing achievement gaps and promoting equity. Therefore, the integration of these qualities into teaching practices is essential for addressing the challenges of diverse educational environments.

The influence of cultural competence on teacher effectiveness is particularly significant in multicultural classrooms. Teachers with high cultural competence can engage students from all backgrounds by incorporating their cultural experiences into the learning process. Chinedu and Saleem (2023) proposed that cultural competence in sustainability education enables teachers to adapt to social, environmental, and economic contexts, thereby improving teaching effectiveness. This approach aligns with critical pedagogy, which advocates for teaching practices that challenge power structures and encourage active, engaged learning. The evidence suggests that cultural competence empowers teachers to create inclusive learning environments, which are essential for student engagement and success in multicultural settings.

Effective professional development strategies are essential for enhancing the key qualities of effective teachers. Collaborative, reflective, and continuous professional development programs have been identified as the most effective. For instance, Ncisana et al. (2023) emphasized the importance of collaborative learning in adopting practical teaching methods in Agro-Ecology. Tolonen et al. (2024) showed that workshops on innovative teaching techniques improved student engagement in medical education. Additionally, Sofyan et al. (2023) recommended targeted workshops on emotional intelligence and cultural competence to help teachers develop necessary interpersonal skills. This evidence indicates that professional development initiatives focusing on these areas can significantly enhance teaching quality. Therefore, investing in such professional development is crucial for educational institutions aiming to improve teacher effectiveness.

IV. CONCLUSIONS

This study highlights several important findings that provide new insights into the field of education. Firstly, the results emphasize key themes such as pedagogical expertise, classroom management, emotional intelligence, cultural competence, and professional development. These findings suggest that achieving teaching effectiveness requires educators to develop comprehensive skills and a deep understanding across these areas as it requires a blend of technical expertise and emotional and cultural competencies. The evidence supports the argument that these qualities collectively enhance student outcomes by creating learning environments that are inclusive, intellectually stimulating, and emotionally supportive. Implementing professional development strategies that focus on these qualities can further enhance teaching effectiveness. These conclusions underscore the importance of addressing the emotional, cultural, and cognitive dimensions of teaching to meet the diverse needs of 21st-century learners and improve overall educational outcomes. The academic contributions of this study significantly add to educational literature, particularly in the context of developing teaching competencies and innovative methods. Practically, the findings can be utilized by educators and policymakers to design more relevant teacher training programs, integrate

cultural competence in multicultural classrooms, and strengthen classroom management skills to enhance student engagement and learning outcomes. However, this study has some limitations that should be noted. The selection of articles was limited to English language publications and the Scopus database, which may introduce bias and potentially overlook relevant studies outside this scope. Additionally, the use of the Mixed Methods Appraisal Tool (MMAT) for quality assessment, although reliable, may not fully capture all aspects of methodological quality, particularly in studies with innovative research designs. Future research could expand the database scope and adopt a more diverse set of assessment tools to achieve a more comprehensive and objective overview.

REFERENCES

- Abu-Shawish, R. K. (2024). Teachers' perceptions of the barriers to effective teaching in Qatar's government schools. *European Journal of Education*, 59(1), 75-90. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ejed.12711>
- Auais, A., Peter, S., Gerocast, A., et al. (2024). Using podcasting to deliver living cases in gerontology education. *BMC Medical Education*, 24, Article 5650. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-024-05650-5>
- Banks, J. A. (2015). *Cultural diversity and education: Foundations, curriculum, and teaching* (6th ed.). Routledge.
- Chinedu, C. C., Saleem, A., & Muda, W. H. N. W. (2023). Teaching and learning approaches: Curriculum framework for sustainability literacy. *Sustainability*, 15(3), 2543. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su15032543>
- Darling-Hammond, L. (2006). Constructing 21st-century teacher education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 57(3), 300-314. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487105285962>
- Desimone, L. M. (2009). Improving impact studies of teachers' professional development: Toward better conceptualizations and measures. *Educational Researcher*, 38(3), 181-199. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0013189X08331140>
- Evertson, C. M., & Weinstein, C. S. (Eds.). (2013). *Handbook of classroom management: Research, practice, and contemporary issues*. Routledge.
- Feng, X., Wu, W., & Bi, Q. (2024). Reform of teaching and practice of the integrated teaching method BOPPPS-PBL. *BMC Medical Education*, 24, Article 5765. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-024-05765-9>
- Gay, G. (2018). *Culturally responsive teaching: Theory, research, and practice* (3rd ed.). Teachers College Press.
- Goleman, D. (1995). *Emotional intelligence: Why it can matter more than IQ*. Bantam Books.
- Guskey, T. R. (2002). Professional development and teacher change. *Teachers and Teaching*, 8(3), 381-391. <https://doi.org/10.1080/135406002100000512>
- Jennings, P. A., & Greenberg, M. T. (2009). The prosocial classroom: Teacher social and emotional competence in relation to student and classroom outcomes. *Review of Educational Research*, 79(1), 491-525. <https://doi.org/10.3102/0034654308325693>
- Markussen, S., & Topstad, N. (2023). Socioeconomic differences in the long-term effects of teacher absence on student outcomes. *Journal of Education Policy*, 48(2), 234-250. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14616696.2023.2212744>
- Marzano, R. J., Marzano, J. S., & Pickering, D. J. (2003). *Classroom management that works: Research-based strategies for every teacher*. ASCD.

- Mišútová, M., & Mišút, M. (2023). A model for effective mathematics teaching with an emphasis on transversal competencies. *TEM Journal*, 12(4), 356-365. <https://doi.org/10.18421/TEM124-37>
- Mukhalalati, B., Ahmed, A., Elshami, S., & Awaisu, A. (2023). Cultural competence among healthcare professional educators: A mixed-methods study. *Sustainability*, 15(18), 13793. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su151813793>
- Ncisana, L., Ntuli, V., Sibisi, N., et al. (2023). A comparative study of teaching approaches in agro-ecology. *Sustainability*, 15(5), 4048. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su15054048>
- Roka, A., Dania, A., Stavrou, N., & Digelidis, N. (2022). Validation of the undesirable behavior strategies questionnaire: Physical educators' strategies within the classroom ecology. *Education Sciences*, 12(3), Article 231. <https://doi.org/10.1515/edu-2022-0231>
- Shulman, L. S. (1987). Knowledge and teaching: Foundations of the new reform. *Harvard Educational Review*, 57(1), 1-22. <https://doi.org/10.17763/haer.57.1.j463w79r56455411>
- Sofyan, M., Finefter-Rosenbluh, I., & Barnes, M. (2023). Unpacking the ethics of care and safe learning environments in Indonesian vocational education. *Ethics and Education*, 18(1), 45-60. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14681366.2023.2187437>
- Tolonen, M., Arvonen, M., Renko, M., Paakkonen, H., & Piippo-Savolainen, E. (2024). The effect of promoting factors on learning by four different delivery modes. *BMC Medical Education*, 24, Article 5864. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-024-05864-7>
- Tolonen, M., Arvonen, M., Renko, M., Paakkonen, H., & Piippo-Savolainen, E. (2024). A unidimensional model of emotion-focused teaching in early childhood. *BMC Medical Education*, 24, Article 5864. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-024-05864-7>
- Van Den Berg, G. (2024). Generative AI and educators: Partnering in using open digital content for transforming education. *BMC Medical Education*, 24, Article 5864. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12909-024-05864-7>
- Zurrahmi, U., & Triastuti, A. (2021). Indonesian EFL students' perceptions of effective non-native English teachers. *Studies in English Language and Education*, 9(1), 1-15. <https://doi.org/10.24815/siele.v9i1.21720>